

Greene County Ambulance Review Study Meeting No. 1

Minutes Summary

Wednesday, October 9, 2024, 6:00 P.M.

Greene County 911 Center, 25 Volunteer Drive, Cairo, NY

Greene County EMS Evaluation Committee Membership:

Steven Near, Beau Dushane, Gerard Laird, Davia Montie, George June, Nadine Myrdycz, Sean Hotaling, Jim DiPerna, Neil Kellegher, Shaun S. Groden, Patrick S. Linger, Matthew Luvera, Harry Lennon, Tom Hobart, Charles Martinez, Edward Bloomer, Patricia Handel, James Thorington, Greg Davis, Richard E. Tompkins, Patrick McCulloch, Sean Mahoney, Greg Cross, Tom Hoyt, Todd Sheridan

Also Attending:

Michael Bulich, Jay Lucas, Daryl Legg, Sherry B. True, James O'Connell, Michael Lanuto, Chad Premo, Thomas Little, Dan King, John Farrell Jr., Dolph Semenza, Paul Macko, Warren Hart, Patty McAneny, Pete Kusminsky, Ray Ward, Debra Bogins, Travis Whitbeck, Jason Watts, Richard Hanse, John A. Bensen, Jeff Russo, and Mike Ryan.

Synopsis:

Chairman Linger opened the meeting at 6:00 p.m. and explained the purpose of the latest ambulance review and emphasized that maintaining the status quo wasn't an option.

Shaun Groden had everyone present introduce themselves including the Greene County Legislature, Greene County Administrator, and the members of Fitch & Associates.

Fitch & Associates outlined the general principles of each of the four options that they presented and also offered some additional recommendations that they referred to as low-hanging fruit.

- Option Zero – Status Quo – Do nothing. Status quo may end up not being an option if some ambulance services go out of business before the end of the year.
- Option One – Establish dispatch agreements with all EMS agencies
- Option Two – Single provider with three coordinated districts (mountain top, valley, river)
- Option Three – Single provider unified County system

Low-Hanging Fruit:

- Create a purchasing consortium for medical supplies and vehicles
- Ensure all unit status changes with 911 dispatch are always documented to help with response times
- Continue to fund flycars
- Standardize training

Questions:

1. Does Greene County have the resources to meet the 90th percentile predictability benchmark of hello time within 14 minutes?

Yes, if Option Three is implemented.

2. How many people would it take to run the current system the way it is right now?

At the time of the first meeting, there was not enough data to answer this question, however, that data has since been collected. See Addendum #1 Existing "Paper" Personnel Outline

3. How many existing personnel work at multiple EMT agencies?

See Addendum #2 Multiple Agency Work Shifts

4. What is the status of administrative staff?

See Addendum #3 Administrative Staff

5. Is there anything mandated by New York State that is antiquated?

Yes. The CON process is outdated and is a hindrance to a system design where there is collaboration.

6. Do we have enough people to operate the system?

There was not sufficient data to answer this question.

7. Does the labor cost amount take into account the overtime component?

There was not sufficient data to answer this question.

8. What is the cost of the current ambulance system?

Combined ambulance costs for towns, villages, and Greene EMS are \$6.60271 million

9. In reference to a slide that broke down the mountain, river, and valley districts, what were 90th percentile times?

See Addendum #4 Evaluation of Current System for the dispatch and enroute times that were achieved nine out of ten times.

10. There was concern that the Greene County Correctional facility does not pay enough for ambulance service.

The response was that the State needs to increase the fee structure.

ADDENDUM #1
EXISTING "PAPER" PERSONNEL OUTLINE

CURRENT EMS CREW SCHEDULES

AGENCY	SUNDAY	DAY SHIFTS 6A-6P						TOTAL SHIFTS/WEEK
		MONDAY	TUESDAY	WEDNESDAY	THURSDAY	FRIDAY	SATURDAY	
CATSKILL	EMT X 4	EMT X 4	EMT X 4	EMT X 4	EMT X 4	EMT X 4	EMT X 4	28
	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	14
COXSACKIE	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
CAIRO	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
GREENVILLE	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
DURHAM	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
HUNTER	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
ASHLAND	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
WINDHAM	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	7
	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	7
GCEMS	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	35
DAY SHIFT TOTAL SHIFTS							MEDIC	56
							EMT	119

<u>AGENCY</u>	SUNDAY	NIGHT SHIFTS 6P-6A						
		MONDAY	TUESDAY	WEDNESDAY	THURSDAY	FRIDAY	SATURDAY	
CATSKILL	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	MEDIC X 2	14
COXSACKIE	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
CAIRO	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
GREENVILLE	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
DURHAM	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
HUNTER	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
ASHLAND	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	EMT X 2	14
WINDHAM	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	EMT X 1	7
	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	MEDIC X 1	7
GCEMS	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	MEDIC X 5	35

NIGHT SHIFT TOTALS	MEDIC	56
	EMT	105

TOTAL SHIFTS CURRENTLY	MEDIC	112	37.3 FTE @ 36 HR/WK
	EMT	224	74.6 FTE @ 36 HR/WK

ADDENDUM #2
MULTIPLE AGENCY WORK SHIFTS

PARAMEDIC LIST

Agency	Status	Additional
GC	FT	Windham PT Cairo PT
GC	PT	Cairo PT Greenville
GC	FT	Catskill FT
GC	FT	
GC	PT	Catskill FT Hunter PT Windham PT
GC	PT	
GC	FT	
GC	FT	
GC	PT	
GC	PT	
GC	PT	Catskill FT EMS Coord
GC	PT	Catskill FT
GC	PT	
GC	FT	Windham FT Cairo PT
GC	FT	Durham PT
GC	PT	
GC	FT	
GC	FT	
GC	FT	Windham PT
GC	FT	Windham PT Dep EMS Coo
GC	FT	Windham PT Cairo PT
GC	PT	Coxsackie FT
GC	FT	
GC	PT	
GC	PT	
GC	PT	
GC	FT	
GC	PT	
GC	FT	
GC	PT	Catskill PT
GC	FT	Catskill FT
GC	PT	
GC	FT	
GC	PT	
GC	PT	Catskill PT Educator
Catskill	FT	
Catskill	PT	
Catskill	FT	
Catskill	PT	Cairo PT Greenville Windham PT
Catskill	PT	Hunter PT Coxsackie Windham PT
Catskill	FT	Cairo PT
Catskill	FT	Windham PT

Catskill	PT
Catskill	PT
Catskill	PT
Windham	PT
Windham	FT
Windham	PT
Windham	FT

EMT LIST

Agency	Status	Additional		
Catskill	PT	Coxsackie PT		
Catskill	PT	Ashland PT	Windham PT	
Catskill	FT	Windham PT		
Catskill	PT			
Catskill	FT			
Catskill	PT			
Catskill	FT	Cairo PT		
Catskill	PT			
Catskill	PT	Coxsackie PT		
Catskill	FT	Greenville	Coxsackie PT	Cairo PT
Catskill	PT	Coxsackie PT		
Catskill	FT			
Catskill	PT	Greenville		
Catskill	PT	Cairo PT		
Catskill	FT	cairo PT		
Catskill	PT	Hunter PT		
Catskill	PT	Greenville		
Catskill	PT	Ashland PT	Hunter PT	Windham PT
Ashland	PT			
Ashland	PT			
Ashland	PT			
Ashland	PT			
Ashland	PT			
Ashland	PT			
Ashland	FT			
Hunter	FT			
Hunter	FT			
Hunter	FT	Windham FT		
Hunter	PT			
Hunter	PT			
Hunter	PT	Windham PT		
Hunter	PT	Greenville		
Hunter	PT	Coxsackie FT		
Hunter	FT			
Hunter	PT			
Durham	PT	Cairo PT	Coxsackie	
Durham	PT			
Durham	PT	Cairo PT		
Durham	PT			
Durham	PT	Cairo PT		
Durham	PT			
Durham	PT	Greenville	Coxsackie PT	
Durham	PT			
Durham	PT			

Durham	PT		
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie FT	
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie FT	
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT	Cairo PT	
Greenville	PT	Windham PT	Catskill PT
Greenville	PT	Coxsackie PT	
Greenville	PT		
Greenville	PT		
Coxsackie	PT	Cairo PT	
Coxsackie	FT		
Coxsackie	PT		
Coxsackie	FT	Cairo PT	
Coxsackie	FT		
Coxsackie	PT		
Coxsackie	FT		
Coxsackie	PT		
Windham	PT		
Windham	PT	Cairo PT	
Windham	PT		

ADDENDUM #3
ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

EMS ADMIN STAFF

AGENCY	TITLE	STATUS
CATSKILL	CHIEF	FT
	SUPERVISOR	FT
	SUPERVISOR	FT
	SUPERVISOR	FT
	SUPERVISOR	FT
COXSACKIE	CHIEF	FT
	CAPTAIN	FT
	CAPTAIN	FT
CAIRO	ADMINISTRATOR	PT
GREENVILLE	CHIEF	PT
	DEPUTY CHIEF	PT
DURHAM	ADMINISTRATOR	PT
HUNTER	ADMINISTRATOR	FT
ASHLAND	ADMINISTRATOR	FT
	ASSISTANT ADMIN	PT
WINDHAM	ADMINISTRATOR	PT
GCEMS	CHIEF	FT
	DEPUTY CHIEF	FT
	CAPTAIN	FT
	CAPTAIN	FT
	CAPTAIN	FT
	CAPTAIN	PT

ADDENDUM #4
EVALUATION OF CURRENT SYSTEM

Evaluation of Current System

	Mountain		River		Valley	
	Onscene-Dispatch	Onscene-Enroute	Onscene-Dispatch	Onscene-Enroute	Onscene-Dispatch	Onscene-Enroute
Average	0:11:11	0:10:59	0:09:54	0:09:51	0:10:16	0:10:06
90th Percentile	0:19:47	0:19:42	0:15:28	0:15:23	0:16:38	0:16:31
FITCH Recommendation at the 90th Percentile	0:15:00	0:15:00	0:10:00	0:10:00	0:15:00	0:15:00
Difference (+=Improvement / -=Worsening)	0:04:47	0:04:42	0:05:28	0:05:23	0:01:38	0:01:31

Response Time Data

**** Duplicates removed

**** Any response less than 1 minute removed

Draft and Confidential

